Evaluation of 'Applicability of the Eururalis scenarios at the fine spatial scales' by Jitka Strakova.

The thesis is a well-documented report of an application of the CLUE model to a small case study area and the translation of European-wide scenarios to the case study context. Overall the report is well written and well documented. Clearly a lot of work was done including interviews, data processing, modeling and literature review. This would, by standards I am familiar with, easily meet the criteria for an Msc thesis.

Some specific remarks:
-a good review of the scenario literature was provided with appropriate references
-the application of the CLUE model is well documented

-in intensive questionnaire was conducted but the results were not discussed in a lot of detail and reported. This is a pity. It would have been nice to see a more integrated use of the questionnaire with the modeling results/set-up. My question would be: how could such an integration be achieved in a better way (different questions?).
In any case the questionnaire is now used to see the preference of the people for one of the scenarios. I think that the main issue is not to determine the preference but more in terms of finding out what are the factors/responses to the developments foreseen.

-figure 11 nicely illustrates that some of the factors used as location factors of land use are not independent from land use. What could be the consequence of this dependence for the further modeling procedure?

-Table 6 provides the comparison of the European scenarios with the local scenarios. Although at some point of the text an explanation is given of the considerations to make these changes (e.g. in terms of population and employment) this is the critical part of scaling scenarios. Indeed, not always will the direction of the main drivers be similar across different scales. I would have expected a bit more structured analysis of the process of translating the European scenarios into the local scenarios

-there is a mention of uncertainty. Could you propose some ways to quantify this uncertainty or to validate the model?

Keith Edwards