



## POSUDEK OPONENTA BAKALÁŘSKÉ PRÁCE

---

Studijní obor: **Anglický jazyk a literatura (dvouoborové studium)**

Název práce: **Edgar Allan Poe as the Progenitor of the Modern Detective Tale**

Autor/-ka práce: **Oldřich Žižka**

Vedoucí bakalářské práce: **PhDr. Mariana Machova, Ph.D.**

Oponent/-ka bakalářské práce: **Richard Stock, Ph.D.**

---

### Stručná charakteristika práce

The thesis mainly analyzes in turn three stories by Edgar Allan Poe, identifying them as the three that define the genre of the “detective story” for Poe and afterward.

### Celkové zhodnocení

This thesis displays a careful reading of these three Poe stories. Oldrich has read and thought about them thoroughly, and is able to draft complete descriptions of those stories. What this thesis does not do so well is use that reading as a basis to make larger and more significant claims related to how these stories fit into American literature, or indeed how the stories compare with other stories. The thesis does not even do a very good job of comparing the three stories themselves. The basic idea of Oldrich’s thesis is something that one can find readily with a quick internet search (that Poe wrote the first “detective stories” and the three main stories are the ones chosen for the thesis), which indicates a lack of originality.

I have several problems with how this thesis is written. Structurally, there is no introduction and often Oldrich relies on section headings and other peripheral features of the text to convey meaning. This is not conventional and not pleasant to read. It reads more like a school report for a teacher than a bachelors thesis for a wider academic audience. There are also several lower-level problems, including sentence structure, the use of colloquial language, and inconsistent citation formats.

The secondary and primary sources used are overall poor as a group. While it is not forbidden, the focus of a thesis in this department should be on English-language sources, and citing translated primary works shows bad judgment in my opinion. I also have similar reservations with using a German-language primary text to compare with Poe’s stories. For secondary sources, there is only one source that appears to be of acceptable quality, but there are no citations to that source. Other sources are low quality. There is also over-reliance on one particular secondary source.

There is less than two pages of material that supposedly defines the “detective story” genre and provides a context for the readings of Poe’s stories and the argument that Poe began the genre. This is not nearly enough and indeed never throughout the entire thesis is a clear definition of the genre given.



In many places the thesis could go into much more depth when addressing topics of the genre and Poe's stories. Generally the readings are competent but superficial. Sometimes the points made show a lack of facility with basic literary analysis. During the readings of the three stories, it is not clear if the intent is to compare the three stories or to describe them separately.

Generally I find many faults with this work, but I approve it based mainly on the fact that it shows that the student has immersed himself at least in these three stories, which are certainly within the canon of American literature.

Práci doporučuji k obhajobě.

Navrhovaná klasifikace:      dobře

16. 6. 2014

---

Datum

---

Podpis