



POSUDEK OPONENTA BAKALÁŘSKÉ PRÁCE

Studijní obor: **AJL - EST**

Název práce: **An analysis of Elvish languages constructed by J.R.R. Tolkien**

Autorka práce: **Valeriia Nolda**

Vedoucí bakalářské práce: **Mgr. Jana Kozubíková Šandová, Ph.D.**

Oponent bakalářské práce: **Mgr. Petr Kos, Ph.D.**

Quality of Research

1) Please rate the following statements about the thesis on a scale of 1 (insufficient) to 3 (excellent)

The topic of the thesis is suitable for the scope and well defined: 3

Sets clear goals or questions for research: 3

Demonstrates conceptual clarity and accuracy: 2

Demonstrates a good understanding of the linguistic methodology work(s) discussed: 2

Engages with the subject critically and analytically: 2

Uses relevant scholarship meaningfully: 1

2) Comment shortly on the quality of the research presented in the thesis:

The thesis deals with two constructed languages created by Tolkien and aims to provide a linguistic analysis of the two languages as well as to find conclusions on the question whether such languages have appropriate features to be considered languages as such. For this end, the author first provides a number of definitions of language; however, this section (Chapter 1) results in a mere list of various approaches to the notion without any stated direction or deeper critical review. Moreover, for her discussion of whether the two conlangs can be seen as (full-fledged) languages, only the last two sets of criteria are used.

Some parts of the thesis do not appear to be directly relevant to the topic discussed. The author, for example, provides a section on Tolkien's life or a description of Esperanto without explaining how these parts are related to the aim of the thesis. Instead of focusing on Esperanto, it would appear more beneficial to provide some introduction to other conlangs used in literature devised by different authors.

The linguistic analysis confines itself to alphabets, phonology and morphology, the description of which is drawn from other works; nevertheless, the author fails to provide (her own) description of syntax of the two languages (e.g. word order), however basic it would be.

Quality of Writing

1) Please rate the following statements about the thesis on a scale of 1 (insufficient) to 3 (excellent)

Has a clear and suitable structure: 2

Employs appropriate register and academic style: 2

Uses correct and relevant terminology: 3

Adheres to academic thesis guidelines, format and MLA style guide: 2

Written in correct and fluent English (both grammar and vocabulary): 2

Carefully edited with few typos or mistakes: 2



2) Comment shortly on the quality of the writing presented in the thesis:

The structure of the text is based on a clear division between theoretical and practical parts (although the parts are not labelled this way). For the cohesion of the text, a synthesis of the two parts would be beneficial.

The description of the origin of the two conlangs and their corresponding alphabets is conceived as if the origin was a historical event and not an artificial creation, cf. *the Tengwar...devised by Noldor* or *the Sindor invented the Cirth* (p. 28), which lowers the academic tone of the text.

The text also includes some grammar mistakes including syntactic structures (reported speech), e.g. *he knew how languages work, how they are changing*, the use of articles *professor constructed the language first* (p. 27), etc. Some sentences do not make sense at all, as in *Carpenter wrote that for him, it is hard to...* (p. 27).

Overall Review and Assessment

(short description of the thesis and its findings, what has been achieved, and areas for improvement)

The thesis deals with the description of two conlangs devised by Tolkien and used in his literary work as well as a discussion whether these invented languages qualify to be classified as languages. For a better overall evaluation of the work, I would expect a more profound critical review of what defines (a) language with an in-depth discussion to what respect the two conlangs match selected criteria; also, at least an attempt for a more independent analysis of the conlangs in question would be welcome.

Questions for Defence

(please provide two questions for the student to answer during their defence)

For the issue of relevance of some parts of the thesis:

Did Tolkien's life experiences have some impact on his idea of creating these conlangs?

Could you please describe the motives and purpose of constructed languages such as Esperanto and the two conlangs invented by Tolkien? Are they comparable?

Práci doporučuji k obhajobě.

Navrhovaná klasifikace: **dobře**

14. 8. 2023

Datum

Podpis